MEETING

ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE

DATE AND TIME

THURSDAY 14TH MARCH, 2019

AT 6.00 PM

<u>VENUE</u>

HENDON TOWN HALL, THE BURROUGHS, LONDON NW4 4BQ

Dear Councillors,

Please find enclosed additional papers relating to the following items for the above mentioned meeting which were not available at the time of collation of the agenda.

Item No	em No Title of Report	
1.	PUBLIC QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS (IF ANY)	3 - 26





Qn No	Ite m No	Raised by	Question Raised	Answer
1	7	Mrs N Lusardi	I would like to ask why you feel not locking the gate to the car park in Oak Hill park will not effect the local residents. I have lived in Parkside Gardens for over 30 years and have had to put up with motorbikes and cars being driven around the park at night and even burnt out in the park. But since the bollards have been put up on Churchill Rd and the carpark locked at night, these crimes have become very rare. I also feel you are opening up an nice quiet place for drug dealers to operate from. Which our over stretched police force don't need. So I strongly feel the gates need to be locked at night	The operational team which locks Oak Hill Park car park regularly report that they are unable to lock the car park due to the presence of cars in the car park after dusk, as such the car park is often omitted from locking. The sites proposed under phase 1 of the ceasing of locking were selected as the current activity does not secure the wider park which is the case for Oak Hill Park. This site is not locked an estimated 70% of the time due to unattended cars AGINAL DA

and it will cost you more in the long run to leave them open. Why wasn't a survey of the number of bins collected from households carried out before the rounds were finalised and has it now been completed? Appendix A was just noted at the Policy and Resources meeting, so is it correct that it is not policy? Is the Environment Committee also responsible for our Parks and Open Spaces? There is no mention of the Open Spaces? There is no mention of the Open Spaces and a confusing 'parks road safety' in the Environment Committee's responsibilities. If Barnet is to continue to claim that, "Barnet is a green and leafy borough with parks and open spaces that are among the best is leader" mere area is a street scane; and safety our street scane; and safety our standard path construction, the only areas where we would use a more flexible material is if the path could be affected by tree routes					
1 Jon Dix number of bins collected from households carried out before the rounds were finalised and has it now been completed? Appendix A was just noted at the Policy and Resources meeting, so is it correct that it is not policy? Is the Environment Committee also responsible for our Parks and Open Spaces? There is no mention of the Open Spaces and a confusing 'parks road safety' in the Environment Committee.' Mary O'Connor O'Connor Spaces and a confusing 'parks road safety' in the Environment Committee.' Appendix A was just noted at the Policy and Resources Committee on the 28th November 2018. All Committee priorities went to Policy and Resources Committee on the 11th December 2018 for information. The constitution (Document 08 Article 7) notes that the Environment Committee is responsible for "all borough-wide or cross-constituency matters relating to the street scene". As noted this includes Parks, Trees and Waterways. Although Open Spaces are not specifically mentioned in this list, they are the responsibilities and it should have said "parks, road safety". Apologies, a comma was missing from the Environment Committee's responsibilities and it should have said "parks, road safety". Asphalt is our standard path construction, the only areas where we would use a more flexible material is if the path could be affected by tree routes					
the Policy and Resources meeting, so is it correct that it is not policy? Is the Environment Committee also responsible for our Parks and Open Spaces? Mary O'Connor Mary O'Connor There is no mention of the Open Spaces and a confusing 'parks road safety' in the Environment Committee's responsibilities. If Barnet is to continue to claim that, "Barnet is a green and leafy borough with parks and open spaces that are among the on the 28th November 2018. All Committee priorities went to Policy and Resources Committee on the 11th December 2018 for information. The constitution (Document 08 Article 7) notes that the Environment Committee is responsible for 'all borough-wide or cross-constituency matters relating to the street scene". As noted this includes Parks, Trees and Waterways. Although Open Spaces are not specifically mentioned in this list, they are the responsibility of Environment Committee's responsibilities and it should have said "parks, road safety". Asphalt is our standard path construction, the only areas where we would use a more flexible material is if the path could be affected by tree routes	2	9	Jon Dix	number of bins collected from households carried out before the rounds were finalised and	numbers present by type - waste, recycling, garden waste and food waste. It was believed that
O'Connor O'Conn				the Policy and Resources meeting, so is it correct that it is not policy? Is the Environment	on the 28 th November 2018. All Committee priorities went to Policy and Resources Committee on the 11 th December 2018 for information.
There is no mention of the Open Spaces are O'Connor Spaces and a confusing 'parks road safety' in the Environment Committee's responsibilities. If Barnet is to continue to claim that, "Barnet is a green and leafy borough with parks and open spaces that are among the street scene". As noted this includes Parks, Trees and Waterways. Although Open Spaces are not specifically mentioned in this list, they are the responsibility of Environment Committee. Apologies, a comma was missing from the Environment Committee's responsibilities and it should have said "parks, road safety". Asphalt is our standard path construction, the only areas where we would use a more flexible material is if the path could be affected by tree routes				· ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Barnet is to continue to claim that, "Barnet is a green and leafy borough with parks and open spaces that are among the should have said"parks, road safety". Asphalt is our standard path construction, the only areas where we would use a more flexible material is if the path could be affected by tree routes	3	13		There is no mention of the Open Spaces and a confusing 'parks	street scene". As noted this includes Parks, Trees and Waterways. Although Open Spaces are
that, "Barnet is a green and leafy borough with parks and open spaces that are among the leafy borough with parks and open spaces that are also below the leafy borough with the leafy borough with the leafy borough with the leafy borough with the				Committee's responsibilities. If	
open spaces that are among the material is if the path could be affected by tree routes					Should have said parks, road saicty.
				, , ,	
				open spaces that are among the best in London" more care is	material is if the path could be affected by tree routes

			required of these, in particular, Sites of Importance for Nature Conservation. These areas need to be protected from asphalt and turning them into transport corridors. Is it not better "to develop a cycle network that will not downgrade paths for pedestrians and the natural environment, especially the Welsh Harp and Sites of Importance for Nature Conservation"?	
4	9	Jon Dix	The report acknowledges there was over confidence in drivers abilities to access challenging roads. Was a representative of the drivers invited to test drive the new larger vehicles before they were purchased?	The only new vehicles which have been brought in the last year are four rear steer RCVs which were ordered in advance of the Environment Committee decision on 5 June 2018. These are not larger than those already used by service. They also have more precise manoeuvrability due to have a smaller, sharper angle of rotation compared to front wheel steering systems. Street Scene have been using vehicles of this type for over 2 years during which time they have been fully tested by our frontline drivers.

_					
		8	Mary O'Connor	There has been a consultation for the Barnet and King George V Playing Fields and West Hendon Playing Fields. Where are the outcomes of these consultations? Were any concerns with these plans expressed? Have the draft	Please find information in relation to the draft masterplan for Barnet Playing Fields/ King George V and West Hendon Playing Fields; https://open.barnet.gov.uk/dataset/barnet-and-king-george-v-playing-fieldsdraft-master-plan-and-feasibility-study https://open.barnet.gov.uk/dataset/west-hendon-playing-fieldsdraft-master-plan-and-feasibility-study
				Master Plans been amended as a result?	
	5	9	Jon Dix	Was the purchase of wider longer vehicles included in the risk assessment and if so, what was the finding and how was the risk mitigated?	Please see question 4.
	6	8	Mary O'Connor	When the new Copthall Leisure Centre was planned on the site of the Gaelic Football Pitch, a requirement of planning was that a new pitch was required. This was to be at the redeveloped National Institute for Medical Research site. Why is this site no longer available	The condition states that in the event that the Gaelic Football Club and pitch displaced by the Copthall Leisure Centre redevelopment is unable to be accommodated within the National Institute of Medical Research or another robustly identified site, a Gaelic Football pitch, and ancillary facilities, that meets Sport England or National Governing body approval shall be made on Montrose Playing Fields. However, following the redevelopment of Montrose playing fields, the Council has identified King George V Playing Fields as the most appropriate and suitable site for Gaelic Football. Future use and provision associated with the National Institute of Medical Research site is under
		·	1	is this site no longer available	Future use and provision associated with the national institute of Medical Research site is under

_				
			when it was fully approved in	review.
			order for the new leisure centre	
			to be placed on the Copthall	
			Gaelic Football Pitch? What	
			sport provision will now be	
			provided at the redeveloped	
			National Institute for Medical	
			Research site and will it cover	
			as large an area as was planned	
			for Gaelic Football?	
			I understand from industry	Operation staff sense checked all routes. As feedback was provide amendments where made,
			experts from outside Barnet that	however, experience has shown the sense checking proved to be better for some routes than
			one of the downsides of route	others.
			planning software is that it does	
			not always pick up road	
			anomalies and as such should	
_		lan Din	always be validated by staff with	
/	9	Jon Dix	a detailed route knowledge to	
			"sense check" them. How many	
			of the routes were "sense	
			checked" by experienced staff	
			before they were introduced and	
			how many were amended	
			following that sense checking?	

8	8	Mary O'Connor	The Barnet and King George V Playing Fields and West Hendon Playing Fields are in the Green Belt or Metropolitan Open Land. Some areas are SINC's but there is no detailed ecological report. Why? What is the impact of these developments on the natural environment?	A preliminary ecological assessment can be found at Appendix 7 via the following links; https://open.barnet.gov.uk/dataset/west-hendon-playing-fieldsdraft-master-plan-and-feasibility-study https://open.barnet.gov.uk/dataset/west-hendon-playing-fieldsdraft-master-plan-and-feasibility-study
9	9	Jon Dix	Does the route planning software easily accommodate manual amendments to the proposed routes?	The software used is able to accommodate manual amendments to route/rounds. This functionality can and has been used to make changes. It will be used to enable adjustments to Monday's collection rounds to be made.
10	8	Mary O'Connor	Dollis Valley Greenwalk passes through the Barnet and King George V Playing Fields and is through a SINC here also. It is also part of the Capital Ring. Why is this not acknowledged as an important pedestrian path, that needs to remain solely as a	Please find all information relating to acknowledgement of green infrastructure in the following link; https://open.barnet.gov.uk/dataset/barnet-and-king-george-v-playing-fieldsdraft-master-plan-and-feasibility-study

			,	
			pedestrian path to cater for the	
			health and well-being of	
			pedestrians? There are	
			alternate quiet streets for	
			cyclists	
			Given that some roads may	The service does not hold this information in this format. One of the principle benefits being
			have 6 or more sections, as	derived from the new rounds is that all vehicle are working in a defined area of the borough on
			highlighted at 4.3 in the report,	each day. As such they can be easily allocated or deployed elsewhere within that area during
			on how many occasions does	that day if service issues arise.
			the route planning software	
			schedule two or more different	
		. 5.	refuse vehicles, two or more	
11	9	Jon Dix	recycling vehicles and two or	
			more green waste vehicles in	
			the same road on the same day,	
			what is the maximum number of	
			different vehicles that have been	
			scheduled for collections in the	
			same road in a single day?	
			Why is bitmac being proposed	Paths are outside the SINC in Barnet and at West Hendon. Gravel or bitmac paths are identified
		Mary	for pedestrian paths? There are	depending on detailed location.
12	8	O'Connor	more suitable materials	
			available and in SINC's where	
			nature conservation is important	

			bitmac should not be used.												
			Can you confirm that the area based collection strategy means	1	This is correct. Rounds are allocated based on proximity to the respective depots in each area. Average travel times are set out in the table below:										
			that, for example, on a Monday, refuse vehicles based in Harrow			Mon (El	N5 2BD)	Tue (N1	L2 9EY)	Wed (N	IW11 7JS)	Thu (N	W7 4PU)	Fri (NW	4 4BG)
			have to travel to the West of the borough before they start collecting and return to Oakleigh Road at the end of their shift	@ 06:	30	Time	Distance	Time	Distance	Time	Distance	Time	Distance	Time	Distance
13	9	Jon Dix		Harrow	HA3 8NT	18 to 28	8.1	20 to 30	8.3	20 to 35	8.3	12 to 20	4.9	14 to 22	5.6
				Oakleigh Depot	N11 1HJ	7 to 10	2.9	5 to 8	1.7	12 to 20	5.4	12 to 16	5.2	12 to 24	5.8
			and how much of their shift is spent travelling from one side of the borough not collecting			ninutes. A				ζ					

		1		
14	8	Mary O'Connor	Item 8. The plans do not identify which areas are in the Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI) at West Hendon or SINC's at both West Hendon and Barnet and King George V Playing Fields. Why has this important information when considering these sites been omitted?	Please refer to the full suite of draft masterplan documents for each site via; https://open.barnet.gov.uk/dataset/west-hendon-playing-fieldsdraft-master-plan-and-feasibility-study https://open.barnet.gov.uk/dataset/west-hendon-playing-fieldsdraft-master-plan-and-feasibility-study
15	9	Jon Dix	Did anyone calculate the mileage, travel time and fuel costs associated with the area based collection strategy and if so what is the additional mileage, travel time and fuel cost compared to the old collections rounds?	Yes. To perform the calculation mileage and travel time information was used. Actual fuel usage act as a proxy for actual mileage driven. A large number of other factors were also taken into account in the planning of these rounds. Tipping locations and vehicles being able to support each other in situ carried greater importance than the journey time to reach the start of the rounds. Average monthly fuel consumption since the round changes has been 2,000 litres less than in the month preceding it.
16	8	Mary O'Connor	The Barnet Unitary Development Plan map, available here http://barnet.devplan.org.uk/map .aspx?map=12&layers=all has	A detailed travel, parking and access study will be required to explore this further and as part of any future planning application.

			some of the plans being in SSSI and SINC's. While it is difficult for me to match these accurately, it would appear that parking sites 2 and 3 are in the SSSI. If so, why is this acceptable? If this is the situation, where is the attempted justification?	
17	9	Jon Dix	Can you clarify if, prior to the route change, drivers only had to have a knowledge of roads in the half of the borough where they were based whereas now they have to have a knowledge of roads all across the borough?	Drivers are and were always expected to work where they are needed within the Borough
18	9	Jon Dix	Can you clarify if any members of the frontline staff, such as drivers, were members of the project team?	Operations managers and supervisors were members of the project team.

19	9	Jon Dix	The report notes that from 27 August frontline staff were invited to take part in structured review sessions. How many staff were invited, how many sessions were held and how many frontline staff attended?	Both scheduled sessions with key drivers and loaders were held as well as drop in sessions that were open to all waste and recycling staff. Union representative and Barnet Homes were also invited to review draft rounds and provide feedback. We believe that over 25 front line staff attended these voluntary sessions.
20	9	Jon Dix	On page 36 the report states that Street Scene is in the process of procuring a fully integrated IT system. What is the cost of this and why wasn't it procured before the round changes were made?	The system could not be procured and implemented prior to the re-routing exercise due to the timeframe relating to OJEU procurement requirements for this level of procurement. The cost of the system cannot be confirmed until the procurement process is completed.
21	9	Jon Dix	The calculation of total staff numbers in figure 13 do not add up. Please can you clarify what are the correct figures?	Error acknowledged. See highlighted figures updated below. Deployed hours for Staff working on Recycling and Waste

				Week	w/c	LBB Staff Core Hours	LBB Staff Addition Hours ^[1]	Agency Hours	Total	
				Week 40	07/01/2019	3,118	869	1,242	<mark>5,229</mark>	
				Week 41	14/01/2019	3,142	852	1,975	<mark>5,969</mark>	
				Week 42	21/01/2019	3,318	852	2,658	6,828	
				Week 43	28/01/2019	3,335	852	2,083	<mark>6,270</mark>	
22	9	Jon Dix	It appears that the number of core staff have reduced by approximately 15 since October (core LBB staffing has reduced by approximately 600 hours per week). Was the reduction due to increased sickness, staff made redundant or did they leave and if they did leave what did their exit interviews identify as the	reorganisation. Formal exit interviews were not carried out.						

^[1] O/T monthly cost evenly distributed over work days in a given month

			reason for leaving?			
23	9	Jon Dix	Of the 7,117 of agency staff hours worked in January, what was the split between drivers and loaders?	Driver 23%	Loaders 77%	
24	9	Jon Dix	The cost of LBB staff per hour appears to peak in January. Is that linked to bonus payments to incentivise staff to work over the Christmas/New Year period and how much was paid in incentive bonuses to LBB staff?			
25	9	Jon Dix	In October, before the changes, LBB staff additional hours were approximately 17% of core hours but by December that had risen to approximately 27% of core hours. What impact did such a high level of overtime in	There is no correlation between those staff working increased overtime and those taking sickness leave or unauthorised absence during this period.		

			November and December have on staff and did it result in the increased level of sickness/unauthorised absence?	
26	9	Jon Dix	What check were made at the time to ensure drivers did not exceed maximum driving hours and has a review taken place of all tachograph charts/written records to audit those checks?	Digital tacho cards are downloaded and checked regularly.
27	9	Jon Dix	How many hours of other street scene staff were diverted from, for example, street cleaning duties, to refuse collection and has this had a detrimental effect on the standard of street cleanliness?	During the initial stages of the changes a small number of staff were redeployed at times of peak demand, i.e. the large mechanical sweep drivers as they hold a LGV licence. Staff from other areas of the service volunteered to assist the recycling and refuse service through overtime. This is accepted practice within operational services to ensure services are resilient. This is reflected in the deployed hours within the report. During this time a significant amount of the managerial focus was diverted to the recycling and waste service from other operational areas such as street cleansing.
28	9	Jon Dix	Is the plan to keep the high proportion of agency staff or is it the intension to recruit permanent staff to phase out the	We are currently going through the recruitment process for permanent Driver Loaders and will appoint in due course. Thereafter we will recruit recycling and waste Loaders

			majority of agency staff?				
29	9	Jon Dix	Given that in the UK over the last 5 years 39 waste workers have been killed mostly by being hit by moving vehicles or machinery, and that as recently as December a refuse worker in Northholt was killed, what safety training is provided to agency staff and permanent staff and has a risk assessment been carried out on the model of using such a high proportion of agency staff?	carefully considers what training is required to ensure that agency staff can operate safely.			
		Jon Dix	How many rounds were in operation before the changes	Service	Pre-round changes	Current	
30	9		and how many rounds are there now split between general	General Waste	19	17	
			waste, recycling and garden	Recycling	16	16	
			waste?	Garden Waste	6	5	

31	9	Jon Dix	What is the average number of collections for each of the garden waste rounds?	1	es of garden	waste collecte	d vary during th	ne year due to se	7 per round. It should easonal changes and refore also vary
32	9	Jon Dix	How many of the new rounds are completed within a standard 8 hour shift and how many rounds need additional overtime or agency staff assistance to complete?	Monday Tuesday Wednesday Thursday Friday	Under 8 Hours 10 16 17 20 24	Approx. 8 Hours 0 0 0 0	Approx. 8-9 Hours 2 3 7 8 9	Approx. 9 to 10 hours 8 5 7 5 2	Over 10 Hours 15 10 4 1
33	9	Jon Dix	Can you clarify if situations arise where the vehicle driver is based in one depot but the loaders for that vehicle are	There is currentl service accomm	•			rangement is in pew member.	place due to the

			based in the other depot?	
34	9	Jon Dix	Can you clarify who is now collecting waste from residential properties above shops, household waste teams or trade waste teams, and what have been the operational implications of the changes?	Waste from flats above shops is currently collected by a mix of mainly commercial and some domestic crews dependent on the area of the borough.
35	9	Jon Dix	Of the 10 additional refuse vehicles on hire each week how many are to replace broken down vehicles and how many are to provide additional capacity on rounds?	This has varied on a daily basis. Spot hiring of vehicles for a single day/days is not an option therefore a vehicle can be used to provide additional capacity if the vehicle it has replaced is repaired while still on hire. Hire vehicles have also been known to breakdown.
36	9		In addition to the vehicles on hire, how many refuse vehicles have been purchased and what was the cost?	4 refuse collection vehicles have been purchased during 2018/19. The total cost was £741,700 (+VAT)
37	9		How often are general waste vehicles left full overnight and what impact does that have on	This has occurred on a handful of occasions when shunt drivers have been unavailable. It is not common practice. The impact depends on where this occurred and the tipping location for the waste stream.

		start time of rounds the next morning?	
38	9	Is green waste held at the Oakleigh Road depot overnight and how often is it sent to Edmonton?	Green waste is bulked and delivered to Edmonton daily. Some residual green waste is on occasion held overnight and transferred the following morning.
39		How often is recycling waste held in the bulking areas at the Oakleigh Road Depot overnight, and is this a fire risk?	Recycling is bulked and delivered to Edmonton daily. Some residual recycling waste is on occasion held overnight and transferred the following morning. We do not believe there is a fire risk.
40	9	How many LBB shunt vehicles are used to transfer waste from Oakleigh Road to Edmonton and has this been reduced/outsourced since the new round changes?	This varies on a daily basis. It has not been outsourced.
41	9	In January you were operating an afternoon crew working between 2pm – 9pm at the Oakleigh Road Depot. Is that shift still operating and is it a	The permanency of an afternoon crew will be looked at further as we look at both ongoing staff availability for this and the need to double shift vehicles to improve service efficiency.

		permanent component of the collection service?	
42	9	How many accident/damages claims have been made since the new larger vehicles were introduced and how does that compared to the number of claims made before the new vehicles were introduced?	Please refer to question 4. The level of accidents/damage claims remains consistent with pre go live levels.
43	9	On how many estates have you cut the number of collections from twice weekly to once a week and how much has that saved?	This has effected 17 estates. We have not calculated how much has been saved.
44	9	If you are now rebalancing Monday and potentially Tuesday and collection rounds are moved to new days, how will this affect area based working?	The changes will be made on the boundary of current area to ensure area basis working/collections continue.
45	9	The report identifies that there were only 225 formal complaints in the three months November,	Please refer to the lessons learned regarding communications. Section 6.4, Appendix A.

		December and January yet during that time there were over 16,000 reported missed bin collections. Many residents reported that they simply couldn't get through the switchboard. Why did the publicity material not contain a designated hotline number and why was the customer service response so poor?	
46	9	Has the on-going problem with subsidence at the Oakleigh Road Depot impacted on the efficiency of the operation such as restricting vehicle movements or parking within the depot and when will the subsistence problems be resolved?	This has had no significant impact on operation. Wilmott Dixon continue to monitor this.
47	9	Given that space at the Oakleigh Rd depot is very restricted, how have the additional purchased and hired	The temporarily elevated vehicles numbers can be accommodated on site and have no impact on our CPC qualified drivers ability to manoeuvre safely within the depot

		vehicles been managed in terms of parking, does it reduce the efficiency of the depot and was an appropriate risk assessment completed to ensure the movement of so many vehicles in such a tight space was carried out safely?	
48	9	Please provide a clear summary of the weekly cost of general, recycling and garden waste collections before the changes and the costs after the changes including the additional vehicle hire, additional fuel costs so that we can understand how much the new changes have saved/cost?	The available financial information is shown in Appendix A.
49	9	Period 10 to end of year forecast for the Waste and Recycling Front Line budget indicates it will be £1.75 million overspent. Given that any changes of this scale are	The industry standard for round reorganisations to embed and settle into business as usual delivery is between three and six months. It would be expected that during this time savings would start to be realised. When the budget for 2018/19 was initially set it was anticipated that changes would have taken place from September 2018 enabling savings to be made in Q4.

		recognised within the waste management industry as taking between three and six months for full business as usual, why wasn't this period of disruption and associated costs not built into the budget?	
50	9	Have you re-forecast the budget for 2019/20 to reflect the problems of implementing the new changes and what is the impact on the MTFS?	The budget set for 2019/20 contains contingency for the risks associated with the implementation of the cost savings. We will recast the forecast to reflect the current performance and include estimates for future realignment of the service during the year.

Public Comment – Item number	Agenda Title	Name
7	Ceasing Parks Locking	Roger Chapman
9	Round Re-organisation Review	Jon Dix

This page is intentionally left blank